

CHARACTERISTICS OF MASCULINITY PRESENTED BY JACKIE ELLIOT AND ITS CHARACTERIZATION IN *BILLY ELLIOT* FILM

¹Widiya*, ²Afina Murtiningrum

^{1,2}Sastra Inggris, Fakultas Bahasa dan Ilmu Komunikasi, Universitas Islam Sultan Agung

*Corresponding Author:
Diyaw057@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study aims to determine the characteristics of masculinity of Jackie Elliot and the characterization in the film Billy Elliot. This study focuses on the character Jackie Elliot who has masculinity characteristics in the film Billy Elliot. It explains and analyze the concept of masculinity using Janet Saltzman Chafetz and Edward Jones's theory of characterization. This study used a descriptive qualitative method. The primary data used in this study were the movie script of Billy Elliot film and the movie of Billy Elliot film. The secondary data used in this study were journals, book, and previous research. The steps used to collect the data were watching the film, reading the movie script, identifying the data, classifying the data, and reducing the data. This study finds the masculinity and characteristics of the character Jackie Elliot. Based on the references used in this study Jackie Elliot has six of the seven characteristics of masculinity, namely physical, function of the male, emotion, intelligence, interpersonal, and other personal characteristics. Jackie Elliot's characterization can be found in four of five ways, characterization through appearance, characterization through dialogue, characterization through internal action, and characterization through reactions of other characters.

Keywords: *Characteristics, Masculinity, Jackie Elliot, Characterization, Billy Elliot Film*

1. INTRODUCTION

Film is a form of audio-visual communication (Howars as cited in Amani, 1). In the film, the spectators know that someone invented and guided the action from the audio and visual. Film is the life picture which is one of the forms of art, the popular from the entertainment, and also business. Film is unique set part from all other media by its quality of free and constant motion (Boggs M. Joseph and Petrie. W. Dennis as cited in Amani, 1). Film gave the image that can bring us in deep understanding about the real life, the emotional spot and popularity than the other media (Amani, 1)

The film is one of the media platforms that are in great demand by people from all walks of life, from children to adults. The film can represent the reality that exists in society. Films are a powerful tool for shaping and reinforcing cultural values and beliefs, and the representations of masculinity in film have a significant impact on how people understand and perform gender. Through film, we can explore how masculinity is constructed and reinforced, including the roles that men are expected to play, the traits that are associated with masculinity, and how men are expected to interact with others. The film can also reveal the negative impact that toxic forms of masculinity can have on individuals and society, such as aggression, violence, and the normalization of harmful behaviors.

Analyzing masculinity through film can provide valuable insights into how traditional gender roles and expectations are portrayed and perpetuated in society. Analyzing masculinity through film can help us to deconstruct harmful gender norms and challenge dominant narratives about what it means to be a man. By examining the representations of masculinity in film and exploring how they reflect and reinforce broader social and cultural norms, we can work to create more equitable and inclusive societies that value diversity and promote gender equality.

Through the characters in the film, the audience can be influenced by the views of the images or characterization of the characters. In this film, audiences are heavily influenced by the characters especially, male characters who male is required to be tough, strong, and independent. Masculinity itself is a set of attributes, behaviors, and roles that generally associated with boys and men (Merdeka & Kumoro 112).

Masculinity is recognized as a social value that regulates how a man should or should not behave (Rosida et al, 66). Masculinity is a concept related to traits or attributes usually associated with boys or men, such as courage, physical strength, and technique or practical ability. Masculinity is a part of gender characteristic, and it is often found in men, although women may have masculine traits too (Merdeka & Kumoro 112). In the Billy Elliot film, masculinity is one of the important themes raised.

Billy Elliot film tells the story of Billy, who dreams of becoming a ballet dancer, but his family wants him to be a boxer. Billy secretly joins ballet practice with Michael and is caught by Jackie Elliot. Jackie realizes Billy's genius and helps him find money to audition in London. Billy is accepted at the Royal Ballet School and becomes a professional ballet dancer. Jackie eventually gives up on his obsession with cultivating masculine traits and appreciates Billy's courage. The film highlights the need to accept gender diversity and challenge societal norms, highlighting the importance of challenging gender clichés and recognizing the need for acceptance.

Based on the issue raised in the background of the study about masculinity which is very clearly portrayed in the object of the study, therefore the title of this study is “The masculinity characteristics and its characterization by Jackie Elliot in Billy Elliot film”.

Gender roles is having such a significant discussion particularly within their position and role in a certain society either for their femininity and masculinity (Rosida & Soraya 16). Therefore, based on Merdeka & Kumoro gender is sex, “therefore”, ‘male; and ‘female’ are sex categories, while ‘masculine and feminine’ are gender categories or gender roles,” (112). According to Zahro (19), a cultural concept which includes distinction in terms of role, behavior, and emotional characteristic between men and women in society is called as gender roles. This is related to the concept of masculinity which are also formed the background in society. Masculinity is a basically defined as a gender characteristic that describe the traditional value of men’s attitude or behavior that is accepted by the society (Bata et al, 29). Furthermore, masculinity is an identity which is believed by our society engaged with men with particular characteristics (Lestari et al, 97). Sulistia (14) defined masculinity as “a worthy and important thing since masculinity is a means to differentiate male and female. Masculinity is a shifting concept time by time”.

Meanwhile Edward Jones in his theory mentioned that characterization is “the process of creating and developing character in work in fictions”(84). Furthermore, characterization according to Bennett and Royle, “the process of authors used to develop character and create images of the characters for the audience called as characterization” (65). Thus, it can be concluded that characterization is the researcher’s way of give the characteristics that exist in the character in a story.

According to Janet Saltzman Chafetz as cited in Merdeka & Kumoro (112-113) who is a researcher from Australia in her book about contemporary American gender role stereotypes there are seven characteristics of masculinity, as follows:

1. Physical

The first one is physical. The masculine traits in this area are virile, athletic, strong, casually dressed, brave, and worryless about aging and appearance (Merdeka & Kumoro 112).

This is following existing statement based on Mayhead (35-36) distresses man performances such in men’s body or the power within, for instance virile, athletic, strong, and brave. But it is unconcerned about appearance and aging.

2. The function of the man

A man is required to provide his family with physical needs, such as income and food (Merdeka & Kumoro 112).

Furthermore, according to Adynugraha (47) there are two aspects that belong to functional characteristics of being masculine : breadwinner and provider.

3. Sexual aggressive

The masculine traits in this area are sexually aggressive, sexually experienced, and accepting single status (Merdeka & Kumoro 112).

This is following existing statement based on Mayhead (35-36) man’s experience in having relationship with woman. It is implied that single status is acceptable.

4. Emotion

The masculine traits in this area are unemotional and stoic (Merdeka & Kumoro 112).

This is following existing statement based on Amani “men should stabilize their emotion when they are facing problems” (31).

5. Intellectual or intelligence
The masculine traits in this area are logical, rational, objective, scientific, practical, mechanical, dogmatic, and active (Merdeka & Kumoro 113).
This is following existing statement based on Mayhead (35-36) man's brain such as logical thinking, rationality, intelligence, objective, and practical.
6. Interpersonal
The masculine traits here are dominating, leading, discipline, independent, individualistic, free, and demanding (Merdeka & Kumoro 113).
"Based on their interpersonal, men usually have leadership, more dominating than women, disciplinarian, more independent, free, individual, and responsibility (Amani, 37).
7. Other personal character
The characteristics in this area are aggressive, success oriented, ambitious, proud, egoistical, confident, trustworthy, decisive, competitive, and adventurous (Merdeka & Kumoro 113).
This is following existing statement based on Mayhead (35-36) strong characteristics of the ambition and effort of getting something that they possess.

Based on Edward Jones there are five ways to analyze characterization as cited in Merdeka and Kumoro:

1. Characterization through appearance
It deals with physical appearances, such as clothing, physical body, and tendency (Merdeka & Kumoro 111).
Furthermore, Andriany stated "the minute we see most actors on the screen, we make certain assumptions about them because of their facial features, dress, physical build, and mannerisms and the way they move" (14).
Boggs also stated that "characterization in film has a great deal to do with casting a major aspect of film characterization is revealed visually and instantaneously" (50).
2. Characterization through dialogue
It states at the way the character projects the speaking, be it in the accent, grammar, or catchphrase. It reveals their social and economic backgrounds, as well as their educational background (think and feel) (Merdeka & Kumoro 111).
Furthermore, Andriany stated, "a great deal is also revealed by how they say it" (15).
Boggs also stated that "actor use of grammar, sentence structure, vocabulary, and particular dialects (if any) reveals a great deal about their character's social and economic level, educational background, and mental processes" (52).
3. Characterization through external action
It tries to project a character by the way they act in the plot (Merdeka & Kumoro 111).
Furthermore, Andriany stated, "sometimes the most effective characterization is achieved not by the large actions in the film by the small, seemingly insignificant ones" (15).
4. Characterization through internal action
It reveals a character by the way they feel and thinks about themselves, whether it is about their dream, fear, emotion, secret, or aspiration (Merdeka & Kumoro 111).

Furthermore, Andriany stated, "internal character's is character minds and emotions which consists secrets, unspoken thoughts, daydreams, aspirations, memories, fear, and fantasies." (16).

5. Characterization through the reaction of other characters

It projects other characters to react towards a character. When it deals with a character it might be connected with gender matter (Merdeka & Kumoro 111).

Furthermore, Andriany stated, "the way other characters view a person often serves as an excellent means of characterization" (16).

2. METHOD

This study is a qualitative approach. Based on Miles and Huberman the definition of qualitative data is, "the data that is usually in the form of words rather than numbers The qualitative data included in rich descriptions and explanations of processes in the context of words, sentences, utterances, and dialogues" (45). Furthermore, Moleong stated in Royadi, et al (86) that qualitative research is research that intends to understand the phenomenon of what is experienced by the subject of the research, such as behaviour, perceptions, motivations, actions, and so on. Not doing statistical analysis using numerical methods. There were data collection methods and data kinds in the data organization. Watching the movie, reading the movie script, identifying the data, classifying the data, and reducing the data were the processes in the data collection process. Furthermore, this study included two different kinds of data: primary data and secondary data. The primary data used in this study were the movie script of *Billy Elliot* film and the movie of *Billy Elliot* film. The secondary data used in this study were journals, book, and previous research. The final step was to analyze the final data and report the data analysis.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

This finding and discussion explain the analysis of The masculinity characteristics and its characterization by Jackie Elliot in *Billy Elliot* film. This chapter discusses and analyzes how are the masculinity characteristics of Jackie Elliot's character portrayed in *Billy Elliot* film and how are Jackie Elliot's characterization portrayed in *Billy Elliot* film based on his characteristics of masculinity.

Masculinity of Jackie Elliot in *Billy Elliot* film

Physical

The first is physical. The masculine traits in this area are virile, athletic, strong, casually dressed, brave, and worriless about aging and appearance (Merdeka & Kumoro 112). It can be seen from the quote below:

It is freezing. A layer of snow covers everything. DAD is in the back yard with an axe. **He is hacking away at the carcass of the old piano.** (*Billy Elliot* 01:04:40-01:05:22).

This quote tells that Jackie Elliot, who was full of strength, was hacking away at the carcass of the old piano so that the piano was destroyed. This is following the characteristic of man who is considered as strong, energetic and powerful. It is described as the physical appearance of string, energetic, and powerful.

Function of the man

The second is function of the man. A man is required to provide his family with physical needs, such as income and food. The masculine trait in this area is providing (Merdeka& Kumoro 112). It can be seen from the dialogue below:

MR. WILKINSON : I've heard a lot about you. Durham's little Gene Kelly, eh?

Your dad worked down the pit, then?

BILLY: yeah

MR. WILKINSON : **Must be hard for the family, being on strike. He is out on strike, isn't he?**

BILLY: Of course

MR. WILKINSON : I shouldn't worry. They won't last long.

MRS. WILKINSON : Tom, don't.

MR. WILKINSON : If they voted, they'd be back tomorrow. It's just a few commies, stirring things up. Let's face it, they haven't got a leg to stand on.

BILLY: Who doesn't?

MR. WILKINSON : It stands to reason. Some pits are just uneconomical. If it costs more to pay everybody to dig the coal out... ..than you get for it when you sell it, what does that say?

BILLY: I don't know.

MR. WILKINSON : You wanna think about that, don't you, son?

MRS. WILKINSON: Tom

MR. WILKINSON: If it was up to me, I'd shut them all down tomorrow. For God's sake. (*Billy Elliot* 00:31:02-00:31:52)

From the dialogue above, it is known that Jackie Elliot who works as a miner shows that Jackie Elliot is a person who can provide for his family. It's one of the functions of men to provide for the family.

Emotion

The third is emotion. The masculine traits in this area are unemotional and stoic (Merdeka & Kumoro 112). This is shown in the dialogue below:

DAD: You weren't thinking of taking it with you?

TONY: If you just wanna stand around getting the shit kicked out of you, that's fine.

DAD: **Some of us are ready to fight back.**

TONY: They're already after you.

DAD: **You're no good to us in jail.**

TONY: I don't plan on getting caught.

BILLY: What's going on?

TONY: Get back to bed.

DAD: Both of you!

TONY: Fuck you.

DAD: Put it down.

TONY: You gonna stop me?

DAD: I'm warning you. You haven't got it in you. You're finished!

TONY: Since Mom died, you're a useless twat. What are you gonna do about it?

BILLY: Stop it! (*Billy Elliot* 00:44:48-00:45:52).

The quote tells Jackie obstructs and prevents Tony from going mining, Tony forces him to go mining. Jackie patiently face Tony's attitude and explained that the situation outside was very dangerous, there was a big demonstration. Jackie is worried that Tony will be caught by the police and go to jail because Jackie knows that Tony will not be strong if he is in jail. Tony always denies what Jackie says. Jackie controlled his emotions because Tony ignored his advice, always insisting on going mining. Finally, Jackie steadfastly saw the situation where Tony was always arguing and in the end, Tony still went to mine.

Intelligence

The fourth is intelligence. The masculine traits in this area are logical, rational, objective, scientific, practical, mechanical, dogmatic, and active (Merdeka & Kumoro 113). The following is a part can be a depiction of this situation:

INT. DAD'S BEDROOM. VERY EARLY.

DAD gets up out of bed. He puts his shirt and trousers on. The clock says five thirty.

INT. CORRIDOR. THE SAME.

DAD comes out of his room. The door to Billy's room is ajar. He looks in and sees TONY and BILLY sleeping.

EXT. OPEN COUNTRY. EARLY MORNING.

DAD trudges across a field. Mist rising in the freezing weather. It is before first light. As he continues we see a crowd of men in donkey jackets and two coaches at the edge of the field. There are no one or two policemen and an official with a clipboard.

DAD nervously walks up to them. **He goes towards the official.** A BLOKE recognizes DAD.

DAD walks away and stands alone at the corner of the field and lights a roll. He looks around at all the blokes. A cluster are laughing together but the whole thing has a sombre air.

DAD goes to get on the bus.

DAD throws his fag away and gets on.

INT. THE BUS. MORNING.

The bus is full of men. They are laughing. It is driving through the town and DAD is sitting next to the window. The bus starts to slow as it approaches the picket line. (*Billy Elliot* 01:17:17-01:17:24).

The quote above tells in the early morning Jackie goes to the mine to work to earn money. The money can be used for Billy's transportation trip to audition for the royal ballet school where it is hoped that Billy can become a professional ballet dancer. Here Jackie can be seen that Jackie tries to find a solution to a problem using logic and practical thinking by working at the mine to earn money because Jackie does not have the money to go to the royal ballet school audition in London.

Interpersonal

The fifth is interpersonal. The masculine traits here are dominating, leading, discipline, independent, individualistic, free, and demanding (Merdeka & Kumoro 113). The example of Jackie Elliot's interpersonal can be seen as portrayed in quote below:

INT. SUPERMARKET. DAY.

DAD and TONY are doing the shopping.

TONY is pushing the trolley. DAD goes to the shelf and picks up a pack of bacon.

TONY takes it off DAD. They carry on.

DAD has a list of stuff and is putting stuff in the trolley. (*Billy Elliot* 00:24:48-00:25:28).

From the quote, it can be seen when Jackie Elliot goes to the supermarket to buy the needs of the house and also makes a shopping list that is needed and puts the goods into the trolley. It can be seen that Jackie is a responsible person because Jackie fulfils his obligations as the head of the family to meet all the needs needed in the family such as in terms of food, because food is the primary thing needed in every family. Jackie is an independent person it can be seen when Jackie goes to the supermarket to buy family needs, and does shopping list that is needed, because usually this is usually done by women, but this is done by Jackie because his wife has died a few years ago. therefore Jackie becomes independent to take care of his family both from the smallest things.

Other personal characters

The sixth is other personal characters. The characteristics in this area are aggressive, success-oriented, ambitious, proud, egotistical, confident, trustworthy, decisive, competitive, and adventurous (Merdeka& Kumoro 113). It can be seen from the dialogue as follow:

DAD: Listen, son, from now on you can forget about the fucking ballet. You can get about the fucking boxing, as well. I'm busting my ass for those pences, and you're... No, from now on you stay here, you look after your nanna. Got it? Good.

GRANDMA: They used to say I could've been a professional dancer, with some training.

DAD: Will you shut up?

BILLY: I hate you! You're a bastard!

BILLY: Get off! (*Billy Elliot* 00:28:33-00:29:18)

From the quote above, it can be seen that Jackie Elliot wants Billy to forget and not dance ballet. Jackie Elliot wants his son to focus on boxing and Jackie Elliot spends money just to include Billy in boxing lessons, even though Billy likes ballet. Thus, that this made Billy hate his father, decisive actions by Jackie Elliot was masculine from other personal.

Characterization of Jackie Elliot in *Billy Elliot* film

Characterization through appereance

The first is characterization through appereance. It deals with physical appearance, such as clothing, physical body, and tendency (Merdeka& Kumoro 111). In the film, the quote relate to the characterization through appereance below:

DAD hits TONY in the face. TONY stagger back.

TONY goes for DAD.

DAD out classes him by giving him a sharp punch to the stomach and TONY drops to the floor.

DAD stands shaking. TONY is winded and his nose is pouring with blood. (*Billy Elliot* 00:15:05-00:15:19).

This quote tells about Jackie Elliot who hit Tony's face strongly and gave a punch in Tony's stomach until Tony fell and Tony's nose was bleeding, the strength of Jackie Elliot

who hit Tony until he fell was the strong physical body possessed by Jackie Elliot and it showed characterization through appearance.

Characterization through dialogue

The second is characterization through dialogue. It reveals their social and economic backgrounds, as well as their educational background (think and feel) (Merdeka & Kumoro 111). The example of characterization through dialogue can be seen from the dialogue below:

TONY: Dad!

DAD: What the fuck are you doing?

TONY: Dad, you can't go back, not now!

DAD: **Look at the state of us!**

DAD: **Look man, I'm finished. What choice have we got. Where else are we going to find the money?**

TONY: please, please, Dad. **Don't do this to me. We'll find the money.** (*Billy Elliot* 00:38:10-00:38:35)

The dialogue above describes that Jackie Elliot is desperate to go mining because Jackie's family is poor and confused about where to get money if they do not mine. That is characterization through dialogue because from the dialogue we can see the economic background of Jackie Elliot's family.

Characterization through internal action

The third is character through internal action. It reveals a character by the way they feel and thinks about themselves, whether it is about their dream, fear, emotion, secret, or aspiration (Merdeka & Kumoro 111). In the film, it relates to the dialogue below:

BILLY: What's wrong with ballet?

DAD: What's "wrong" with ballet?

BILLY: It's perfectly "normal "

DAD: Perfectly normal?

GRANDMA: I used to go to ballet

BILLY: see!

DAD: **Aye, for your nanna. For girls, not for lads, Billy. Lads do football, or... ..boxing, or.....wrestling. Not frigging ballet.** (*Billy Elliot* 00:27:09-00:27:42).

The dialogue above describes that Jackie Elliot is getting emotional when Billy wants ballet, not boxing. From within Jackie Elliot wants his son to take boxing lessons. Because Jackie wants Billy to become a professional boxer so that later Billy not should work as a miner like Jackie, that is what Jackie wants Billy without Billy knowing. At least do things that are done by men like football, boxing, etc. instead of doing ballet which is generally done by women. This is a characterization through internal action where we can see Jackie Elliot's characters from internal action that have been carried out and Jackie Elliot's emotional feelings when Billy did not box as his father wanted.

Characterization through reaction of other characters

The last one is characterization through reaction of other character. It projects other characters to react towards a character. When it deals with a character it might be connected with gender matter (Merdeka & Kumoro 111). In the film, the dialogue

between Jackie Elliot and Tony relates to the characterization through the reaction of the other characters below:

DAD: **Put it down.**

TONY: You gonna stop me?

DAD: **I'm warning you.**

You haven't got it in you. You're finished!

TONY: Since Mom died, you're a useless twat. What are you gonna do about it?
(*Billy Elliot* 00:44:48-00:45:23).

The quote above describes that Jackie see Tony taking tools to mine, Jackie immediately asks Tony to put the tools back, but Tony does not want to do it and instead challenged Jackie. Jackie tries not to angry and control his emotions after Tony challenges him. Then Jackie tries to warns Tony not to go mining. But again and again, Tony ignored Jackie's words and give sentences that hurt Jackie a little. After that, Tony just left leaving Jackie and going mining. From this situation, Jackie is an emotional person because he can hold his emotions in dealing with Tony, a stoic when he sees Tony who does not want to listen and do his orders.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion and conducted by this study, Jackie Elliot has masculinity characteristics, that can be summarized in two results, the first is the characteristics of masculinity through Jackie Elliot's portrayal using Janet Saltzman Chafetz's concept of masculinity, and the second is characterization of Jackie Elliot using Edward Jones's theory.

The first result is about masculinity there are six characteristics found in Jackie Elliot. The first is physical, Jackie Elliot is powerful and strong person. The second is function of the man, Jackie Elliot provides his family with the physical body such as income, he is a backbone and breadwinner. The third is emotion, Jackie Elliot makes logical and rational decisions, stoic, control his emotion when facing problems. The fourth is intelligence, Jackie Elliot finds the solution to a problem using his logic, and practical thinking. The fifth is interpersonal, Jackie Elliot is someone who is responsibilities and independent. The last is other personal character, in which Jackie Elliot has success oriented, egoistical, ambitious person, and decisive person.

The second result is characterization using Edward Jones's theory. There are five characterization found in Jackie Elliot. The first one is characterization through appearance, Jackie Elliot has a strong physical body and is a powerful person. The second one is characterization through dialogue he has a simple family with a middle to lower economic background. The third one is characterization through internal action, Jackie Elliot is someone who not only thinks about himself but also thinks about his family, especially his children, so Jackie Elliot feels fear and emotion if something happens to his family and children. The last one is characterization through the reaction of other characters, Jackie Elliot is an emotion person and stoic person according to Tony, and Jackie Elliot is an egoistical person and ambitious person according to Billy Elliot.

REFERENCES

- Adynugraha, N. (2019). The masculinity of James Bond as Seen in from Russia with Love Film. Repository of Department of English Letters Faculty of Letters Universitas Sanata Dharma Yogyakarta.
- Amani, Z. (2014). The Masculinity Analysis of Main Character in Simone Film. Repository SyarifHidayatullah State Islamic University.
- Andriany, Any. (2011). The Representation of Masculinity Through William James as Main Character in The Hurt Locker Movie. Repository SyarifHidayatullah State Islamic University.
- Bata, Z., Asanti, C., & Nasrullah. (2022). The portrayal of Masculinity of Captain Frederick Wentworth in Persuasion Novel. E-ISSN 2549-7715. Volume 6, 28-45.
- Bennett, A. and Royle, N. (2004.). An Introduction to Literature, Criticism and Theory. Edinburgh: Pearson Education.
- Jones, Edward H. Outlines of Literature: Short Stories, Novels, and Poems. New York: Macmillan, 1968.
- Lestari, Silvya W., et al. (2018). "Masculinity in the Character of Margo Roth Spiegelman in Paper Towns Novel." Ilmu Budaya, vol. 2, no. 1, 8 Jan. 2018, doi:10.30872/ilmubudaya.v2i1.1017.
- M. Boggs, Joseph and Dennis W. The Art of Watching Film. London: Mayfield Publishing Company, 2000.
- Mayhead, Robin. Understanding Literature, London: Cambridge University Press, 1974.
- Merdeka, P., & Kumoro, K. A. (2018). "Masculinity in the 1930s Reflected in Public Enemies Film." Insaniyat: Journal of Islam and Humanities, vol. 2, no. 2, 2018, pp. 109–129.
- Miles, H.B. Huberman, A.M. Qualitative Data Analysis. Sage Publication: Thousand Oaks California, 1944.
- Rosida, I., & Soraya, A. (2017). Gender Relation in Willow Trees Don't Weep Novel (2014) by Fadia Faqir: A Feminist Literary Criticism. Insaniyat: Journal of Islam and Humanities, 2(1), 13-28.
- Rosida, I., Merdeka, P., Chaliza, A. N., Nisa, A. A., & Sodikin, M. (2022). Toxic masculinity in Michael Rohrbach's American Male. LITERA, 21(1), 66-80. <https://doi.org/10.21831/ltr.v21i1.39792>.
- Royadi, Dedy., et al. (2019). "Effectiveness Management of Qualitative Research in Writing Scientific Papers" Vol 3, No. 1, January 2019 e-ISSN: 2622-6804 p-ISSN: 2622-6812.

Sulistia, R. (2016). Female Masculinity Of Fa Mulan And Its Impact Towards Her Relationship With Male Characters In Disney Movie Mulan. *Litera Kultura: Journal of Literary and Cultural Studies*, 4(3). <https://doi.org/10.26740/lk.v4i3.16319>.

Zahro, Jamilatux. (2014). Gender Role of the Main Character in The Novel One True Thing by Anna Quindlen. *Repository of English Language and Letters Department of Humanities Maulana Malik Ibrahim State Islamic University of Malang*.